

**United States Department of Agriculture** 

Agricultural Research Service

Technical Bulletin Numbe<u>r 1931</u>

September 2013

# Long-Term Trends in Ecological Systems: A Basis for Understanding Responses to Global Change



## Contents

| Contributors          | VIII |
|-----------------------|------|
| Technical Consultants | X    |

## *Introduction to Cross-Site Comparisons and History and Organization of the EcoTrends Project*

| Chapter 1: Long-Term Trends in Ecological Systems: An Introduction to Cross-Site Comparisons |    |
|--|----|
| and Relevance to Global Change Studies   | 1  |
| Chapter 2: History and Organization of the EcoTrends Project                                 | 21 |

#### Cross-Site Comparisons of Ecological Responses to Global Change Drivers

| hapter 3: Cross-Site Comparisons of Ecological Responses to Climate and Climate-Related      |    |
|--|----|
| Drivers  | 28 |
| hapter 4: Cross-Site Comparisons of State-Change Dynamics                                    | 36 |
| hapter 5: Patterns of Net Primary Production Across Sites                                    | 42 |
| hapter 6: Cross-Site Comparisons of Precipitation and Surface Water Chemistry                | 46 |
| hapter 7: Cross-Site Comparisons of Ecological Responses to Long-Term Nitrogen Fertilization | 51 |
| hapter 8: Long-Term Trends in Human Population Growth and Economy Across Sites               | 54 |
| hapter 9: Disturbance Regimes and Ecological Responses Across Sites                          | 58 |
| hapter 10: Cross-Site Studies "By Design": Experiments and Observations That Provide New     |    |
| Insights   | 72 |

## Long-Term Trends in Global Change Drivers and Responses at Site and Continental Scales

| Chapter 11: Long-Term Trends in Climate and Climate-Related Drivers  | 81   |
|--|------|
| Chapter 12: Long-Term Trends in Precipitation and Surface Water Chemistry  | 115  |
| Chapter 13: Long-Term Trends in Human Demography and Economy Across Sites  | 162  |
| Chapter 14: Long-Term Trends in Production, Abundance, and Richness of Plants and Animals                                | 191  |
| Chapter 15: Management and Policy Implications of Cross- and Within-Site Long-Term Studies                               | 206  |
| Chapter 16: Recommendations for Data Accessibility   | 216  |
| Chapter 17: Long-Term Research Across Sites, Ecosystems, and Disciplines: Synthesis and                                  |      |
| Research Needs   | 226  |
| Appendices   |      |
| Appendix 1: Site Descriptions  | 234  |
| Appendix 2: Average (Standard Error) Maximum, Mean, and Minimum Air Temperature<br>and Annual Precipitation at Each Site | .312 |

| Appendix 3: Average (Standard Error) Ice Duration, Sea Level, Streamflow, Water Clarity, and Water<br>Temperature for Sites With Data   | er<br>. 314 |
|---|-------------|
| Appendix 4: Regression Coefficients and $R^2$ Values for Nine Climatic Variables for Which Linear<br>Regression Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05)  | . 316       |
| Appendix 5: Annual Average (Standard Error) Nitrogen (as Nitrate) From Various Sources at Sites<br>With Data  | . 319       |
| Appendix 6: Regression Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup> Values for Nitrogen (as Nitrate) From Various Sources for Which Linear Regression Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05)                   | . 321       |
| Appendix 7: Annual Average (Standard Error) Nitrogen (as Ammonium) From Various Sources at<br>Sites With Data   | . 323       |
| Appendix 8: Regression Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup> Values for Nitrogen (as Ammonium) From Various<br>Sources for Which Linear Regression Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05)               | . 325       |
| Appendix 9: Annual Average (Standard Error) Sulfur (as Sulfate) From Various Sources at Sites<br>With Data  | . 326       |
| Appendix 10: Regression Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup> Values for Sulfur (Sulfate) From Various Sources for<br>Which Linear Regression Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05)                    | . 328       |
| Appendix 11: Annual Average (Standard Error) Chloride From Various Sources at Sites With Data .   | . 330       |
| Appendix 12: Regression Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup> Values for Chloride From Various Sources for Which<br>Linear Regression Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05)                            | . 332       |
| Appendix 13: Annual Average (Standard Error) Calcium From Various Sources at Sites With Data  | . 334       |
| Appendix 14: Regression Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup> Values for Calcium From Various Sources for Which<br>Linear Regression Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05)                             | . 336       |
| Appendix 15: Human Population and Economy Variables in 2000 for the Focal County of Each Site,<br>as Grouped by Ecosystem Type  | ,<br>. 338  |
| Appendix 16: Annual Average (Standard Error) Aboveground Net Primary Production (ANPP) at<br>Sites With Data  | . 341       |
| Appendix 17: Other Measures of Average (Standard Error) Terrestrial Production at Sites With Data   | 343         |
| Appendix 18: Average (Standard Error) Aquatic Production at Sites With Data   | . 344       |
| Appendix 19: Average (Standard Error) Biomass of Primary Producers (Plants, Algae) for Sites With Data  | n<br>. 345  |
| Appendix 20: Average (Standard Error) Plant Species Richness for Sites With Data  | . 347       |
| Appendix 21: Average (Standard Error) Animal Abundance for Sites With Data  | . 349       |
| Appendix 22: Average (Standard Error) Animal Species Richness for Sites With Data   | . 352       |
| Appendix 23: Regression Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup> Values for Plant and Animal Variables for Which Line.<br>Regression of Each Variable Against Time Is Significant (p < 0.05) and the Trend | ar          |
| Appears Linear  | . 353       |
| Appendix 24: Lead Principal Investigator(s) (PI), Information Managers (IM), and Administrative<br>Program of the LTER Programs   | . 355       |
| Appendix 25: Researchers Involved in the EcoTrends Project at Non-LTER Sites  | . 359       |

| Appendix 26: List of Stations and Length of Record for Each Climate Variable by Site                                     | 362   |
|--|-------|
| Appendix 27: List of Stations and Length of Record for Each Precipitation or Surface Water<br>Chemistry Variable by Site | . 367 |
| Appendix 28: List of Stations and Length of Record for Each Plant and Animal Variable by Site, as                        |       |
| Grouped by Ecosystem Type  | . 371 |
| Index  | i     |

#### Long-Term Trends in Ecological Systems:

### Appendix 26. Stations and length of record for each climate variable by site

(Sites are grouped by ecosystem type.)

| Site code  | Variable          | Station  | Start | End  |
|------------|-------------------|--|-------|------|
| Alpine and | d arctic          |  |       |      |
| ÂRC        | Air temperature   | Toolik Lake Field Station  | 1989  | 2005 |
|            | Precipitation     |  | 1989  | 2005 |
|            | Ice duration      | Toolik Lake  | 1988  | 2005 |
|            | Water clarity     |  | 1989  | 2004 |
|            | Water temperature |  | 1975  | 2004 |
|            | Streamflow        | Kuparuk River  | 1983  | 2004 |
| GLA        | Air temperature   | Glacier Lakes Ecosystem Experiments Site   | 1989  | 2005 |
|            | Precipitation     |  | 1995  | 2005 |
| LVW        | Air temperature   | USGS Biological Resources Division and Water<br>Resources Division meteorological stations | 1984  | 2006 |
|            | Precipitation     | NADP Station CO98, Rocky Mountain National<br>Park, Loch Vale, CO                          | 1984  | 2006 |
|            | Streamflow        | Loch Outlet  | 1984  | 2004 |
|            | Water temperature |  | 1992  | 2006 |
| MCM        | Air temperature   | Lake Hoare   | 1988  | 2007 |
|            | Precipitation     | Lake Bonney  | 1995  | 2006 |
|            | Streamflow        | Onyx River at Vanda  | 1969  | 2004 |
|            | Water temperature | Von Guerard Stream at F6   | 1990  | 2005 |
| NWT        | Air temperature   | C-1 Meteorological Station   | 1953  | 2006 |
|            | Precipitation     | -  | 1965  | 2006 |
|            | Ice duration      | Green Lake 4   | 1982  | 2006 |
|            | Streamflow        |  | 1982  | 2001 |
| Aridlands  |                   |  |       |      |
| EOA        | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #358029, Squaw Butte<br>Experimental Station, OR                                  | 1937  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation     |  | 1937  | 2008 |
| JRN        | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #294426, Jornada Experimental<br>Range, NM  | 1916  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation     | -  | 1919  | 2008 |
| RCE        | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #107648, Reynolds, ID   | 1962  | 2007 |
|            | Precipitation     | -  | 1962  | 2007 |
|            | Streamflow        | 036x68 streamflow station  | 1963  | 1995 |
| SEV        | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #298387, Socorro, NM  | 1893  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation     |  | 1899  | 2008 |
| SRE        | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #027593, Santa Rita Experimental<br>Range, AZ                                     | 1951  | 2004 |
|            | Precipitation     |  | 1951  | 2004 |
| WGE        | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #028619 Tombstone, AZ   | 1898  | 2007 |
|            | Precipitation     | ,  | 1898  | 2007 |
|            | Streamflow        | Flume 1  | 1958  | 2008 |

#### A Basis for Understanding Responses to Global Change

| Site code | Variable          | Station   | Start | End  |
|-----------|-------------------|---|-------|------|
| Coastal   |                   |   |       |      |
| CCE       | Air temperature   | Lindbergh Field Airport, San Diego, CA  | 1927  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1927  | 2008 |
|           | Sea level         | NOAA Station 9410170, San Diego, CA   | 1906  | 2008 |
|           | Water clarity     | Inshore Area at CCE   | 1969  | 2007 |
|           | Water temperature | Scripps Institution of Oceanography Pier  | 1917  | 2006 |
| FCE       | Air temperature   | Royal Palm Ranger Station   | 1950  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1950  | 2008 |
|           | Sea level         | NOAA Station 8724580, Key West, FL  | 1913  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow        | Tamiami Canal at S-12-A (USGS 254543080491101)  | 1964  | 2008 |
|           | Water clarity     | Duck Key, Taylor Slough/Panhandle Site 9  | 2000  | 2004 |
|           | Water temperature | National Data Buoy Center Station LONF1,<br>Long Key, FL  | 1993  | 2008 |
| GCE       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #091340, Brunswick, GA   | 1915  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1918  | 2008 |
|           | Sea level         | NOAA Station 8670870, Ft. Pulaski, GA   | 1936  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow        | Altamaha River at Doctor Town (USGS)  | 1932  | 2008 |
|           | Water temperature | Hudson Creek  | 2002  | 2008 |
| MCR       | Air temperature   | MeteoFrance Afareaitu #2  | 1977  | 2007 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1977  | 2007 |
|           | Sea level         | Papeete station, Moorea   | 1976  | 2008 |
| PAL       | Air temperature   | Palmer Station  | 1975  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1990  | 2008 |
|           | Ice duration      | Palmer Basin  | 1979  | 2006 |
| PIE       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #193505, Haverhill, MA   | 1901  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1901  | 2008 |
|           | Sea level         | NOAA Station 8443970, Boston, MA  | 1921  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow        | Parker River at Byefield MA (USGS)  | 1945  | 2009 |
| SBC       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #047902, Mission Creek, Santa<br>Barbara, CA   | 1895  | 2006 |
|           | Precipitation     | Santa Barbara County Public Works Department<br>Flood Control District Site at Ellison Hall Roof,<br>UC Santa Barbara | 1952  | 2007 |
|           | Sea level         | NOAA Station 9410660, Los Angeles, CA   | 1924  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow        | USGS Station 11119500, Carpinteria Creek<br>near Carpinteria CA   | 1941  | 2007 |
|           | Water temperature | Santa Barbara Manual Shore Station, Santa<br>Barbara Harbor   | 1955  | 2004 |
| VCR       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #446475. Painter 2W VA   | 1956  | 2007 |
|           | Precipitation     |   | 1956  | 2007 |
|           | Sea level         | NOAA Station 8534720. Atlantic City NJ  | 1912  | 2008 |
|           | Water clarity     | Phillips Creek Mouth  | 1992  | 2008 |

### Long-Term Trends in Ecological Systems:

| Site code  | Variable                         | Station  | Start | End  |
|------------|----------------------------------|--|-------|------|
| Eastern fo | rests                            |  |       |      |
| BEN        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #310724, Bent Creek, NC   | 1949  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1949  | 2004 |
|            | Streamflow                       | USGS Station 03448000, French Broad River at<br>Bent Creek, NC                               | 1935  | 1986 |
| CRO        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #031730, Crossett 7 S, Crossett, AR   | 1916  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1916  | 2008 |
| CWT        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #312102, Coweeta Experimental Station, NC   | 1943  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1944  | 2008 |
|            | Streamflow                       | Watershed 18 flume   | 1937  | 2007 |
| FER        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #466867, Parsons 1 NE, WV   | 1899  | 2006 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1905  | 2006 |
|            | Streamflow                       | Watershed 1 at Fernow  | 1952  | 2007 |
| HAR        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #227840, Saucier Experimental<br>Forest, MS   | 1955  | 2004 |
|            | Precipitation                    | ,  | 1955  | 2006 |
| HBR        | Air temperature                  | Weather Station Headquarters   | 1957  | 2007 |
|            | Ice duration                     | Mirror Lake  | 1968  | 2005 |
|            | Precipitation                    | Hubbard Brook Ecosystem Study Headquarters   | 1978  | 2008 |
|            | Streamflow                       | GS Watershed 6   | 1963  | 2007 |
| HFR        | Air temperature                  | Harvard Forest Meteorological Stations Shaler<br>and Fisher (sequential at same site)        | 1964  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1964  | 2008 |
| LUQ        | Air temperature                  | Bisley Tower   | 1996  | 2004 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1988  | 2004 |
|            | Sea level                        | NOAA Station 9755371, San Juan, PR   | 1963  | 2008 |
|            | Streamflow                       | Puente Roto gage   | 1987  | 2006 |
| MAR        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #213303, Grand Rapids Forest Lab, MN  | 1916  | 2007 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1916  | 2007 |
|            | Streamflow                       | Total runoff of South Unit Watershed S2 weir   | 1962  | 2006 |
| NTL        | Air temperature                  | NWS COOP #475516, Minocqua Dam, WI   | 1904  | 2008 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1904  | 2008 |
|            | Ice duration                     | Lake Mendota   | 1856  | 2008 |
|            | Streamflow                       | USGS Station 05427948, Pheasant Branch at Middleton, WI                                      | 1975  | 2007 |
|            | Water clarity                    | Sparkling Lake   | 1981  | 2007 |
|            | Water temperature                |  | 1982  | 2008 |
| SAN        | Air temperature<br>(max and min) | NWS COOP #388922, Walterboro 1 SW,<br>Walterboro SC  | 1904  | 2008 |
|            | Air temperature<br>(mean)        | Conglomerate of data from Santee, ChARP, Lotti,<br>Met5 Met25 and Witherbee weather stations | 1946  | 2005 |
|            | Precipitation                    |  | 1946  | 2007 |
|            | Streamflow                       | Control Watershed 80 flume   | 1990  | 1999 |

#### A Basis for Understanding Responses to Global Change

| Site code | Variable            | Station  | Start | End  |
|-----------|---------------------|--|-------|------|
| TAL       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #229079, University, MS   | 1902  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1905  | 2008 |
| WBW       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #406750, Oak Ridge, TN  | 1949  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1949  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow          | West Fork of Walker Branch Watershed   | 1982  | 2005 |
| Temperat  | e grasslands and sa | vannas   |       |      |
| CDR       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #211227, Cambridge 5ESE, MN   | 1893  | 2007 |
|           | Precipitation       | Conglomerate of Ft. Snelling and Composite datasets  | 1837  | 2008 |
| FTK       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #245690, Miles City-Frank Wiley<br>Field, MT  | 1938  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1938  | 2008 |
| GRL       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #342818, El Reno 1 N, NV  | 1893  | 2006 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1893  | 2006 |
| GSW       | Air temperature     | Riesel, TX   | 1940  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       | Rain Gauge 75A   | 1938  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow          | Stream gage Y2   | 1940  | 2008 |
| KBS       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #203504, Gull Lake Biological<br>Station, MI  | 1934  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1931  | 2008 |
|           | Ice duration        | Gull Lake. MI  | 1924  | 2006 |
|           | Streamflow          | Kalamazoo River at Comstock, MI (USGS)   | 1931  | 2009 |
| KNZ       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #144972, Manhattan, KS  | 1899  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1898  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow          | USGS Station 06879650, Kings Creek near<br>Manhattan KS  | 1980  | 2008 |
| SGS       | Air temperature     | Central Plains Experimental Range (1944-1968)<br>and Shortgrass Steppe 11 (1969-present)<br>weather stations | 1944  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       |  | 1944  | 2009 |
| SPR       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #349760, Woodward, OK   | 1909  | 1976 |
|           | Precipitation       | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·  | 1909  | 2007 |
| Urban     |                     |  |       |      |
| BES       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #180465, Baltimore Washington<br>International Airport, MD  | 1940  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation       | _  | 1940  | 2008 |
|           | Sea level           | NOAA Station 8574680, Baltimore, MD  | 1903  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow          | Villanova  | 1957  | 2009 |
| CAP       | Air temperature     | NWS COOP #021026, Buckeye AZ   | 1894  | 2002 |
|           | Precipitation       | · · · · ·  | 1894  | 2002 |
|           | Streamflow          | USGS Station 09502000, Salt River below<br>Stewart Mountain Dam, AZ  | 1941  | 2007 |

### Long-Term Trends in Ecological Systems:

| Site code | Variable          | Station  | Start | End  |
|-----------|-------------------|--|-------|------|
| Western f | orests            |  |       |      |
| AND       | Air temperature   | Climatic Station at Watershed 2  | 1958  | 2006 |
|           | Precipitation     |  | 1958  | 2006 |
|           | Streamflow        | Watershed 2  | 1953  | 2008 |
|           | Water temperature | Lookout Creek upper thermograph site   | 1977  | 2006 |
| BNZ       | Air temperature   | LTER1  | 1989  | 2009 |
|           | Streamflow        | C3 Flume in the Caribou-Poker Creeks Research<br>Watershed                         | 1969  | 2007 |
| CHE       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #356366, Otis, OR   | 1950  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |  | 1949  | 2008 |
| CSP       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #043161, Fort Bragg 5N, CA  | 1935  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |  | 1913  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow        | South Fork Caspar Creek  | 1986  | 2004 |
|           | Water temperature | ARF Station  | 1989  | 2004 |
| FRA       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #053261, Georgetown, CO   | 1898  | 2006 |
|           | Precipitation     |  | 1909  | 2006 |
|           | Streamflow        | Lower Fool Creek   | 1941  | 1984 |
| PRI       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #107386, Priest River Experimental<br>Station, ID                         | 1901  | 2008 |
|           | Precipitation     |  | 1901  | 2008 |
|           | Streamflow        | USGS Station 12395000, Priest River near Priest<br>River, ID                       | 1950  | 2008 |
| WIN       | Air temperature   | NWS COOP #459342, Wind River, WA and NWS<br>COOP #451160, Carson Fish Hatchery, WA | 1931  | 2009 |
|           | Precipitation     |  | 1931  | 2008 |
|           |                   |  |       |      |